Internet Printing Protocol WG Minutes
February 25, 2013

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3:00pm ET February 25, 2013.

Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)
Daniel Manchala (Xerox)
Tim McCann (Konica Minolta)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Glen Petrie (Epson)
Roarke Randall (Toshiba)
Michael Sweet (Apple)
Paul Tykodi (TCS)
Larry Upthegrove (End-User)
Bill Wagner (TIC)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
    a. Policy accepted with Mike taking the minutes
2. Review previous minutes
    a. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20130128.pdf
    b. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-f2f-minutes-20130207.pdf
    c. Approved as posted
3. Status of PWG Last Call on MSN2 (ended on 25 January)
    a. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-pwgmsn20-20130125-rev.pdf
    b. quorum achieved (8 review acknowledgments, 1 with comments)
    c. Mike needs to fix errors in ABNF prior to formal vote
    d. ready for Formal Vote per IPP session at PWG F2F
4. Status of IPP FaxOut (Mike)
    a. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippfaxout10-20130122-rev.pdf
    b. Mike to issue new draft
5. Status of IPPS URI Scheme (Ira)
    a. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/draft-mcdonald-ipps-uri-scheme-06-20121110.pdf
    b. reply from Barry Leiba (IETF Apps AD) on 11 February
    c. "I've looked over the document, and I think it's in very good shape."
    d. Barry requested a new I-D w/ minor editorial changes
    e. Barry will look into IETF reviewers for LDAP Printer Schema
6. IPP Everywhere Certification
    a. Q: Do we register self-certification results?
        - A: Legal agreement will require it
    b. Concern: don't want an expensive/paid certification program
        - Consensus today and last two face-to-face meetings is that this will be a free self-certification program
    c. Q: Is this a logo program?
        - A: Yes, with permission to use the logo based on self-certification
    d. Q: Do we require results to all
    e. Action: Mike to post updated slides/document for self-certification logo program for IPP Everywhere
7. Review IPP Best Practices (Smith)
    a. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/whitepaper/tb-ipp-best-practices-20130205.pdf
    b. Remember to add Validate-Job as a possible operation when a printer is selected (confirms access)
    c. 4.5.1:
        - "with document data" instead of "by value"

- Drop "in whole or in part"
- Add authentication/encryption to validate-job advantages
- Add xxx-actual attributes to create-job discussion: you see any substitutions before job processing
- Add "allows cancel-job during document submission" to create-job discussion
- Drop "means that the client doesn't have to be prepared for an early HTTP response"
- Drop "allows the job URI to be learned before job payload is sent"

d. 4.5.2:
- "with document references" instead of "by reference"
- Drop "doesn't work well with flow-controlled (low-end) printers"
- Other tweaks same as 4.5.1
- Notes about accessibility/visibility of document references - printer may respond with client-error-document-access-error status code, or might add document-access-error to job-state-reasons; also URI may not be accessible at time of processing

e. Need to include HTTP Expect header on client side (to catch authentication/SSL upgrade issues before transmitting everything)

f. Add best practice: Always provide the document-format when known since auto-sensing is not always perfect

g. Maybe also add a section talking about job submission attributes and recommended attributes and values
- document-format with specific format
- media-col vs. media
- pdl override
- etc.

h. Q: Can Validate-Job or Validate-Document validate a document URI?
- A: No
- Have talked about adding a "get URI" first class operation to validate access to a document URI

i. 4.6:
- Maybe add some discussion of polling intervals - some reasonable interval and not continuously as fast as the printer/network can take it...
- Poor: Get-Jobs + Get-Printer-Attributes (polling without knowing job ID)
- Good: Get-Job-Attributes + Get-Printer-Attributes
- Better: Create-Printer-Subscription + Get-Notifications + Get-Job-Attributes
  - Client needs to check whether printer supports subscriptions
- Line 438: Job object is always created as long as the IPP request message has been accepted; 0-length document data may or may not create a job object (implementation-defined) but a non-empty document MUST create a job object - see RFC 3196.

j. 4.7:
- Poor: Print-Job with truncated data followed by Cancel-Job
- Good: Create-Job, Send-Document, Cancel-Job (potentially truncating Send-Document)

k. 4.8:
- Better: Create-Printer-Subscription + Get-Notifications + Get-Printer-Attributes
- Also poll when you see certain printer-state-reasons (marker-low, etc.)

l. Drop section 5

m. 7:
- Add boilerplate "same as 2911" text
- Also maybe talk about document access/privacy, use of encryption, etc.

n. Drop section 8

o. 9.1:
- Drop RFC 2119
- Add RFC 2911
- Add RFC 3196
- Add PWG IPP specifications (IPP Everywhere, JPS3, IPP 2.0 SE)
- Add Bonjour and WS-Discovery references (from IPP Everywhere)
  - updated to point to published RFCs

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP conference call is March 11, 2013 at 3pm ET
- Put MSN2 up for PWG Formal Vote
- Review new draft of FaxOut service
- Continue discussing IPP Everywhere self-certification
- Action: Mike to post updated slides/document for self-certification logo program for IPP Everywhere
- Action: Mike send errata notice for FaxOut job-state-reasons to SM list (DONE)
- Action: Bill and Nancy to investigate Get-Printer-Supported-Values equivalent in SM (DONE)
- Action: Mike to send errata notice for FaxOut conditional requirement to SM list (DONE)
- Action: Mike to send errata notice for FaxOut CoverSheetInfo names and capabilities (DONE)
- Action: Ira to contact Anne Price about collaboration (DONE)
- Action: Mike to contact Anne Price about logos (DONE)
- Action: Mike to determine legal status of PWG (DONE)
- Action: Ira to encourage IETF ADs to get IPPS and LDAP RFCs pushed through (DONE)
- Action: Ira to update milestones in IPP WG charter (PENDING)
- Action: Ira/Bill to submit technical errata to RFC 3805 to replace CR with CR + LF to be consistent with 5198 and others (PENDING)
- Action: Ira and Mike to review 5100.x specs to remove action items, fix boilerplate copyright text in early specs, fix header/footer/document titles as needed, and fix normative references to drafts, etc. (ONGOING)
- Action: Ira and Mike to work with IANA to update registry to include a "set allowed" column for attributes and improve the plain text formatting (ONGOING)
- Action: Mike and Paul to reach out to label/portable printer vendors to join IPP WG discussions (ONGOING - Paul to send out before next concall)