

Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes January 4, 2016

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3:00pm ET January 4, 2016.

Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)
Daniel Manchala (Xerox)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Mike Sweet (Apple)
Paul Tykodi (TCS)
William Wagner (TIC)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
 - IP policy accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. Approve IPP minutes from previous meeting
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-f2f-minutes-20151207.pdf>
 - Approved as posted.
3. Status of various IPP documents (Ira/Mike/Smith)
 - IPP WG Charter (Mike)
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/charter/ch-ipp-charter-20151225.pdf>
 - Adds IPP 3D Printing Extensions as a project
 - PWG Formal Vote concluded on 12/25/15, approved
 - IPP 2.0, 2.1, 2.2 (Mike/Ira)
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/standards/std-ipp20-20151030-5100.12.pdf>
 - PWG Standard 5100.12-2015
 - Not to be published in IEEE catalog (per PWG SC 12/17/15)
 - Schedule - Smith/Mike to follow up with IEEE-ISTO folks
 - IETF IPP/1.1 Updates (Mike/Ira)
 - <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-rfc2910bis-07.txt>
 - <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-rfc2911bis-06.txt>
 - Changes for new IETF Proposed Standard
 - Barry Leiba (IETF ART AD) will be AD sponsor - note on 07/12/15
 - 2911bis reviewed by IPP WG on 11/16/15
 - 2910bis reviewed by IPP WG on 12/07/15
 - Schedule - IETF Last Call in Q1/Q2 2016
 - IPP Everywhere Printer Self-Certification (SELCERT) (Mike)
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeveselfcert10-20151110-rev.pdf>
 - Stable draft - with new PWG process updates
 - Schedule - PWG Last Call ends January 18, 2015

- Have 7 of 9 responses needed for quorum so far
- IPP Job Password Repertoire" (Smith)
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wp-job-password-repertoire-20160101-rev.pdf>
 - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2015/018661.html>
 - Reviewed by IPP WG on 12/07/15
 - Plan is to register stand-alone (without enclosing IPP spec)
 - Schedule - IPP WG review and IANA registration in Q1 2016
- IPP Staple and Punch Origins/Angles/Dimensions (Smith/Ira/Mike)
 - <http://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2015/018651.html>
 - Off-list discussion on 11/06/15 to 11/09/15 started by Smith
 - Potential errata update to IPP Finishings 2.0 based on JDF attributes
 - Mike/Ira to review JDF attributes and propose IPP extensions
- 4. Review of IPP System Service (Ira/Mike)
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippssystem10-20151206-rev.pdf>
 - Interim draft - need to add more operation and attribute details
 - Reviewed by IPP WG on 12/07/15 (only section 6.27 Startup-All-Printers)
 - Remove redundant Restart-Xxx-Printer(s) - keep Shutdown & Startup
 - Schedule - Prototype draft in Q1/Q2 2016
 - Get-Printers
 - Not authenticated (but may be encrypted like any other request)
 - Limit attributes to discovery attributes (e.g. LDAP schema)
 - Default is to only return printer-uri-supported, uri-authentication-supported, uri-security-supported
 - Get-Resources
 - Not a user operation, authenticated
 - Also minimizes scans for old firmware, etc.
 - Possible definition of Get-Printer-Details/Get-Printer-User-Supported-Values operation in the future as an authenticated version of Get-Printer-Attributes that filters based on the authenticated user
 - Q: Add discussion of common message parameters? (request-id, operation-id, status-code, version)
 - A: Maybe just a pointer to 2910/2911 at the beginning of section 6, following standard encoding of requests and responses.
 - Started at section 7
 - Global: Change any "values for this attribute are" to "values for this attribute include".
 - Section 7.1.x: Remove "for the operation" from descriptions?
 - Section 7.1.3:
 - Make 1setOf, merge in 7.1.4
 - Section 7.1.4:
 - Delete, merge with 7.1.3
 - Line 1322: Clarify/reword first sentence? Delete "for the operation"?
 - Line 1325: "The values for this attribute are" change to "include"
 - Single value for Create-Printer, multiple values for Get-Printers
 - Move list of values to section 7.7 (where printer-service-type is

- defined as a Printer Status attribute)
- Section 7.1.5:
 - Q: resource-categories?
 - A: No keep single-valued
- Section 7.1.6:
 - Make 1setOf mimeType
 - Single value allowed for Create-Resource/Send-Resource-Data
 - Multiple values allowed for Get-Resources
- Section 7.1.9:
 - Can be sent in either Create-Resource or Send-Resource-Data request.
 - Line 1365: Forward reference should be to resource-k-octets.
- Action: Mike to fix *-k-octets in IANA IPP registry - should be Status attributes
- Q: What status code to return when a resource is too large?
 - A: client-error-request-entity-too-large
- Section 7.1.14:
 - Line 1398: Missing double quote on "printer-is-accepting-jobs"
 - Q: What about "Down" and "Testing" States from MFD Model?
 - A: Have 'shutdown' value for "printer-state-reasons" (defined in RFC 2911)
 - Define new 'testing' value to harmonize with MFD Model/ Host MIB
 - "printer-state" for both is 'stopped'.
 - 'stopped': add "that don't have the 'shutdown' or 'testing' values in their "printer-state-reasons" attributes."
 - Add 'shutdown' and 'testing' values.
 - 'all': add "regardless of their state".
- Finished at the end of 7.1.x.
- Q: Should Startup-xxx restart something that is already started?
 - A: No, RFC 3998 only allows a shutdown service to be started
- Q: Should we require a Start-Printer after Create-Printer?
 - A: No, Create-Printer starts the new service (stopped and not accepting jobs)

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next conference calls January 11, 2016 at 4pm ET (IPP 3D) and January 18, 2016 at 3pm ET
- Continue review of RFC2910bis and RFC2911bis
- Continue discussion and scoping of System Service operations and attributes
- Start review of IPP 3D Extensions as standards-track document.
- Action: Mike to fix *-k-octets in IANA IPP registry - should be Status attributes
- Action: Mike to post updated drafts of RFC2910bis and RFC2911bis (DONE)
- Action: Everyone to post their list of user operations for the system service to the IPP WG list (DONE - Only Get-Printers and Get-Printer-Attributes are user

operations)