Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes
May 9, 2019

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3pm ET on May 9, 2019.

Attendees

Cihan Colakoglu (Kyocera)
Smith Kennedy (HP)
Jeremy Leber (Lexmark)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Michael Sweet (Apple)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
   - http://www.pwg.org/chair/membership_docs/pwg-ip-policy.pdf
   - IP policy accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. Approve IPP minutes from previous meetings
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20190425.pdf
   - Approved as posted.
3. Status/Review of various IPP mailing list notes
   - https://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/020079.html
     - RFC: pages-per-subset (1setOf integer(1:MAX)) vs. job-pages-per-set (integer(1:MAX)) (Mike)
     - Consensus: deprecate pages-per-subset
     - Action: Mike to post deprecation template for pages-per-subset attribute to IPP list
     - Comment: Best practice/policy should be to deprecate attributes/values first, then obsolete in later document update unless there is an obvious need (security/etc.) to obsolete immediately
   - https://www.pwg.org/pipermail/ipp/2019/020081.html
     - Prototyping of IPP System service is complete!
     - Q: Should the next draft be labeled stable?
       - A: Yes
4. Status of AMSC and ISO liaisons w/ PWG (Paul)
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-f2f-minutes-20190417.pdf
   - See IPP minutes from PWG F2F on 04/17/19 and 04/18/19
5. Status of PWG Formal Approvals and Last Calls (All)
   - PWG Safe G-Code Subset v1.0 (Mike)
     - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-pwgsafegcode10-20190318.pdf

- - Stable draft - for a Best Practice
  - "safe-gcode-supported" to "pwg-safe-gcode-supported" (for consistency)
  - Mike: material-extruder-diameter in IANA consideration needs to be material-nozzle-diameter (typo, needs to match text)
  - PWG Formal Approval extended 5 May 2019 ends 4 June 2019
  - Quorum achieved
- IPP Authentication Methods (Smith)
  - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippauth-20190328.pdf
  - Stable draft - for a Best Practice
  - PWG Last Call (second) started 11 April 2019 ends 11 May 2019
  - Quorum achieved
  - SC will review process via mailing list, then start PWG Formal Vote
  - Note: Chris Rizzo's comment will be addressed before publication
- IPP Document Object v1.1 (Mike)
  - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippdocobject11-20190418.pdf
  - Stable draft - Errata update for a Candidate Standard
  - PWG Call for Objections started 21 April 2019 ends 21 May 2019
  - No objections so far

6. Quick Review of IPP Production Printing Ext v1.1 (Mike)
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippppx11-20190501-rev.pdf
   - https://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/020073.html
   - https://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/020077.html
   - Errata update of PWG 5100.3-2001
   - Initial draft
   - Q: Should we make things required?
     - Ira: Yes
     - Smith: Yes
     - Bill: Uneasy with new title and just v1.1 - definitely a major version if we change conformance requireents
     - Mike: Maybe, but how to group?
     - Consensus is to continue discussion
   - Move non-production attributes to Job Extensions
     - media-col required
     - others conditionally required/recommended as appropriate
   - Q: Do we need to support reverse order document processing?
     - A: No
     - No known implementations, came from Xerox R&D
     - Also not compatible with the overrides spec (5100.6) - would require update of 5100.6 to resolve issues
     - Consensus is to obsolete
     - Action: Mike to post obsoletion template for page-order-received attribute to IPP list
   - Title: v2.0?
   - Abstract: Reword to include more detail about the features, "used for" instead of "needed for"

- Section 1:
  - "used for" instead of "needed for"
  - "often use" instead of "make use of"
  - "dedicated HUMAN operators"
  - Drop "media-col" mention since we'll put that in Job Extensions v2.0
- Section 3.1:
  - "And given the desire to specify ..."
  - Move media-col/other migrated attribute items to Job Extensions v2.0
- Sections 3.2.3, 3.2.4, 3.2.6:
  - Move to Job Extensions v2.0
- Section 3.5:
  - Move removed attributes to Job Extensions v2.0
  - Fix extra and
- Section 4:
  - Move removed attributes to Job Extensions v2.0
  - "for production printing that specify:"
  - Check title, for consistency "IPP Model"???
- Section 4.1:
  - Title: "Imaging Coordinate System and Units"
  - Add feed direction arrow to figure, add roll to top so it is clear where the media comes from
  - Remove extra copy of figure 1
- Section 4.3:
  - Consensus is to drop
- Section 4: Add subsections for each feature group, with tables with lists of attributes
- Section 5:
  - Break up table 1 into feature-grouped tables for section 4
- Section 5.1.14:
  - Consensus is to deprecate media-input-tray-check, provide rationale WRT media-source member attribute of media-col
- Stopped at section 5.1.14
- Next update v2.0, start talking about conformance requirements
- Schedule - TBD
7. Quick Review of IPP Job Accounting v1.0 (Mike)
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippaccounting10-20190418.pdf
   - Initial draft - for a Best Practice
   - Schedule - TBD
   - Did not get to this
8. Quick Review of Canon IPP Extensions (Rick)
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/slides/20190417%20New%20IPP%20Attributes%20Proposal%20from%20Canon.pdf
   - https://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2019/020072.html
   - Initial proposal - PWG F2F review in April 2019

- - Canon provided additional feedback from PWG F2F on 04/26/19
  - Schedule - TBD
  - Did not get to this
9. Quick Review of HP Print Quality Customization (Smith)
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/white-hp-ipp-custompqi-20190423-rev.pdf
   - Interim draft - Whitepaper
   - Schedule - TBD
   - Did not get to this
10. Status of various IPP documents (All)
    - IPP Message Catalog Help Extensions (Smith)
      - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ipptooltip-20190419.pdf
      - Initial draft - for a Best Practice
      - IPP WG review on 04/25/19
      - Schedule - IPP WG approval in Q2/Q3 2019
    - IPP Everywhere 1.1 (Mike)
      - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeve11-20190128-rev.pdf
      - Stable draft - for a Candidate Standard
      - Defer IPP WG Last Call until IPP Everywhere Self-Cert v1.1 is ready
      - Schedule - Stable working drafts/beta tools in Q2 2019
    - IPP Everywhere Self-Certification Manual v1.1 (Mike)
      - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeveselfcert11-20180704-rev.pdf
      - Prototype draft - for a Candidate Standard
      - Update and start IPP WG Last Call together w/ IPP Everywhere v1.1
      - Schedule - Stable working drafts/beta tools in Q2 2019
    - IPP System Service (Ira/Mike)
      - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippsystem10-20190130-rev.pdf
      - Prototype draft - PWG F2F discussion in April 2019
      - Update per PWG F2F in April 2019
      - Schedule - Stable working draft and PWG Last Call in Q2 2019
    - IPP Job Extensions v2.0 (Mike)
      - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippjobext20-20190418-rev.pdf
      - Stable draft - PWG F2F discussion in April 2019
      - Updated to DEPRECATE "document-format-details"
      - Schedule - IPP WG Last Call and PWG Last Call in Q2 2019
    - IPP Enterprise Printing Extensions v2.0 (EPX) (Smith)
      - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippepe-20190327.pdf
      - Initial draft - PWG F2F review in April 2019
      - Update per PWG F2F in April 2019
      - Schedule - Prototype draft Q3 2019
    - IPP Encrypted Jobs and Documents (Mike)
      - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ipptrustnoone10-20190418-

rev.pdf
- Interim draft - PWG F2F review in April 2019
- Updated to change from Registration to Specification
- Schedule - Prototype draft Q3 2019
11. Open Printing update (Ira)
- OP monthly calls (02/12/19) and (03/05/19) and (04/02/19) and (05/07/19)
- OP website renovation major progress using Jekyll - finish in May/June 2019
- GSoC 2019 Accepted student proposals announced (05/06/19)
- All five OP projects received GSoC 2019 slots and have assigned students

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next conference calls on May 23 and June 6, 2019 at 3pm ET
- Review Job Extensions v2.0, Canon extensions, Print Quality extensions, and Job Accounting at next call (in that order)
- Action: Mike to post deprecation template for pages-per-subset attribute to IPP list
- Action: Mike to post obsoletion template for page-order-received attribute to IPP list
- Action: Mike to start IPP WG Last Call of IPP Job Extensions v2.0 ending May 9 (DONE)
- Action: Smith to work out logistics of contracting for IPP 3D prototype GUI (DONE)
- Action: Smith to follow-up on the 3MF liaison agreement (DONE)