Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes
March 19, 2020

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3pm EST.

Attendees

Cihan Colakoglu (Kyocera Document Solutions)
Smith Kennedy (HP)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Chris RIzzo (Xerox)
Michael Sweet (Lakeside Robotics)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Uli Wehner (Ricoh)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
   - https://www.pwg.org/chair/membership_docs/pwg-ip-policy.pdf
   - IP policy accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. Brief Discussion of System Service Discovery with DNS-SD
   - https://github.com/istopwg/ippsample/wiki/IPP-System-Service-Discovery-with-DNS-SD
   - Consensus is to accept proposal as posted
   - DNS-SD Service Type
     - Name should be the same for embedded System service on MFP, but not for print servers fanning out to multiple devices
   - DNS-SD LOC Record
     - "should publish a LOC" (not public)
   - Do as an IPP Registration document so we can do the IANA DNS-SD service type registration
     - Action: Mike to post an initial draft of IPP System Service Discovery with DNS-SD document
3. Status of PWG and IPP WG Formal Approvals and Last Calls (All)
   - IPP Transaction-Based Printing Extensions v1.1 (Mike)
     - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ipptrans11-20200226-rev.pdf
     - https://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2020/020455.html
     - Stable draft - for a Candidate Standard errata update
     - PWG Call for Objections ends on 27 March 2020
     - Schedule - PWG Candidate Standard in Q1 2020
   - IPP Everywhere 1.1 (Mike)
     - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeve11-20200312-rev.pdf
     - Stable draft - for a Candidate Standard errata update
     - IPP WG Last Call ended on 12 March 2020

- For final IPP WG review on 26 March 2020
- Schedule - PWG Call for Objections Q1 2020
  - IPP Everywhere Self-Certification Manual v1.1 (Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeveselfcert11-20200312-rev.pdf
    - Stable draft - for a Candidate Standard errata update
    - IPP WG Last Call ended on 12 March 2020
    - For final IPP WG review on 26 March 2020
    - Schedule - PWG Call for Objections Q1 2020
4. IPP Everywhere Self-Certification
   - IPP Everywhere predates Mopria, was originally started as alternative open certification to AirPrint for Windows and other platforms
   - Why implement in addition to Mopria and AirPrint?
     - Supported by CUPS which addresses all Linux and ChromeOS
     - Exercises more of IPP, improves quality of implementation (for free)
       - Historically embedded software development hasn't included as much focus on testing or standards conformance, more about getting a product out that works
     - IPP Everywhere can be seen as the foundation of both Mopria and AirPrint
   - Some tests failing on AirPrint/Mopria certified printers
     - IPP Everywhere self-cert tests are more extensive for specific IPP conformance issues that have driven interop issues with CUPS and other print clients
     - Some differences in supply level attributes (marker-xxx vs. printer-supply-xxx)
   - Should update the slides talking about the value proposition of IPP Everywhere vs. other vendor licensing programs
     - How to compare to proprietary specs given there are IPR issues?
       - Have to stick to publicly available information (not subject to IPR restrictions)
     - What additional capabilities can be provided?
     - Focus on quality and interoperability vs. single platforms
       - Support for new platforms simplified
       - Alternative for services that are going away (e.g. Google Cloud Print)
   - Mike is available as an impartial/independent resource for IPP issues
6. Review of IPP Driverless Printing Extensions v2.0 (Smith)
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd-ippnodriver20-20200204-rev.pdf
   - Interim draft - Candidate Standard update for PWG 5100.13-2013 (JPS3)
   - IPP WG review on 12 March 2020 ended at section 8.6
   - Section 2.x:
     - Make sure Impression, Input Page, Media Sheet, and Set terms reference STD92 and use STD92 definitions
   - Section 10.4:
     - Do not remove ABNF (resolve comment)
   - Section 11:

- - Action: Mike to review section 11 of NODRIVER, suggest changes to be consistent with STD92
  - Use Input Page, Impression, Media Sheet, and Set terminology instead of page, impression, sheet, and copy
- Section 12:
  - Title: "Implementation Guidance"
- Section 12.2:
  - Title: "Printer Resources"
  - Maybe use bullets for list of requirements
  - Action: Mike to add ipp->http/ipps->https when generating URIs in section 8.4 of IPP Everywhere 1.1.
- Global: Make sure all conformance requirements for values are placed on the Printer (Printer MUST or Printer SHOULD) and not on the value
- Sections 13 and 14: Fix table styles (first column not bold, bold header, normal style for cells)
- Section 15.1:
  - "a Printer MUST support the required:"
  - Reorder bullets so section numbers are increasing
  - Add "Printers MUST NOT support" with list of sections for obsolete attributes and values
- Section 15.2:
  - "a Client MUST support the required:"
  - Reorder bullets so section numbers are increasing
- Section 15.3:
  - Drop since the content is in section 12.2
- Section 17:
  - Reword opening paragraph to indicate there is more than just STD92.
  - See IPP System Service for an example
- Section 18.1:
  - Update Mike's email
- Section 19.1:
  - Smith will take a pass through this to reflect the changes so far
- Section 20:
  - Verify the ABNF is normative or informative - check other published specs
  - Drop RFC3382 (part of STD92)
- Finished review!
- Schedule - Prototype draft in Q2 2020

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next conference calls March 26 and April 9, 2020 at 3pm
- Next call to focus on IPP Everywhere 1.1 and self-cert
- Action: Mike to post an initial draft of IPP System Service Discovery with DNS-SD document

- Action: Mike to review section 11 of NODRIVER, suggest changes to be consistent with STD92
- Action: Mike to add ipp->http/ipps->https when generating URIs in section 8.4 of IPP Everywhere 1.1.
- Action: Mike/Smith/Ira to research how to deal with TLS before the date/time is set on printer (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to propose alternate implementation of eliminate-margins using imposition-template (PENDING)
- Action: Mike and Ira to contact UK GovPrint for current status (PENDING)
- Action: Mike, Smith, and Ira to provide 3D printing liaison slide updates (PENDING - need to talk with Paul to determine which slides these are)