Internet Printing Protocol WG Face-to-Face Minutes
December 6, 2011

Meeting was called to order at approximately 1:15pm local time December 6, 2011.

Attendees

Jacob Brown (Dell)
Nancy Chen (Oki Data - call in)
Derek Garner (Dell)
Justin Hutchings (Microsoft - call in)
Tim McCann (Konica Minolta)
Ira McDonald (High North/Samsung - call in)
Joe Murdock (Sharp)
Ron Nevo (Samsung)
Glen Petrie (Epson - call in)
Jessie Sanchez (Intel)
Michael Sweet (Apple)
Jerry Thrasher (Lexmark)
Paul Tykodi (TCS - call in)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Jay Wang (Toshiba - call in)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)
Pete Zehler (Xerox - call in)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
    a. Policy accepted with Mike taking the minutes
2. Review of previous conference call minutes:
    a. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20111128.pdf
    b. Approved as posted
3. Slides
    a. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/slides/ipp-wg-agenda-december-11.pdf
4. JPS3
    a. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippjobprinterext3v10-20111129-rev.pdf
    b. Use CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED in IPP specs?
        -   Yes, but only for features, omit for attribute pairs.
        -   Put conformance requirement in second sentence after initial description.
        -   Action: Mike to adopt CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED in JPS3, PWG Raster, and IPP Everywhere 1.0
    c. Document fidelity
        -   No way to guarantee deep validation that a document can be printed
        -   Objection to terminology
    d. What about a "continue on error" flag/attribute for a job?
        -   Continue printing or stop/abort job
        -   job-error-action/-default/-supported keyword Job Template attribute
            -   continue-job
            -   abort-job
            -   stop-job (suspend-current-job?)
            -   Look at 2911 for other possible values

- Add note: this cannot stop print service by itself, might return printer to idle state if no other jobs enqueued
- Action: Mike to add job-error-action Job Template attribute to JPS3
- Action: Mike to fix operations table in IPP registry
e. Validate-Document operation
    - Full processing of document without marking
    - No way to do accounting/billing of processor usage (no job)
    - Instead of an operation, provide a Job Template attribute to do processing but no marking of the job ("no-print" job) like proof print and saved job.
    - JPS2 already covers this: "proof-print-copies" can have a value of 0 for no print.
    - But we do want a Validate-Document operation to validate Document Template, Document Description, and Operation attributes that would be supplied in a Send-Document or Send-URI operation.
        - Action: Mike to add Validate-Document operation to JPS3 based on Validate-Job (no document content but optional URI)
        - document-uri validation is limited to inspection of URI scheme and not the content reference the URI
        - State SHOULD NOT validate content?
        - Additional semantics of Validate-Job for document-uri operation attribute
f. printer-input-tray
    - Needed in parallel with media-source-properties
    - Make Index required to provide a way to correlate with other sources
    - The i'th element of printer-input-tray must correspond to the i'th element of media-source-supported
    - CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED, condition is that both printer-input-tray and media-source-supported are required
    - media-source-supported: redefine to be both media-source member attribute and media attribute values.
    - "id" in table needs to be "Id"
g. printer-output-tray
    - CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED, condition is that both printer-output-tray and output-bin-supported are required
    - i'th element of printer-output-tray must correspond to the i'th element of output-bin-supported
    - Make StackingOrder and PageDeliveryOrientation REQUIRED
        - No unknown values, must have a valid value
        - Q: How to handle output trays that support both face-up and face-down?
            - A: "other" value for StackingOrder means both face-up and face-down are supported
    - Make Index REQUIRED for correlation with other sources
    - Extend output-bin-supported with more keyword values
        - "tray-N" values plus others as needed
        - Add note that "face-up" and "face-down" values for output-bin are superceded by 5100.3 page-delivery to control whether output should be face up or face down (rather than specifying a particular output bin)
h. printer-supply
    - Make Index REQUIRED
i. Section 1.5: Localization
    - Need to talk about performance concerns - how does a client know whether the local message catalog is up-to-date

- Add section on HTTP If-Modified-Since header support (SHOULD) in JPS3 (for localization, icons, profiles)
- Action: Mike to make HTTP If-Modified-Since header support REQUIRED in IPP Everywhere
    j. Section 2.1: CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED: "that applies to a ..."
    k. Section 5.1.1:
        - "Printers MUST accept and Client MAY provide the REQUIRED "document-dc-metadata" operation attribute ..."
        - Add reference to ABNF (now [STD68])
        - Action: Mike to update ABNF references to [STD68] in all drafts
        - DC metadata is independent of any document content
    l. Add named features to cover TLS/HTTP Upgrade and other features and refer to those names throughout (maybe 3.6 Named Features?)
    m. Section 5.1.2: CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED, use named feature
    n. Section 5.1.5: Fix pagination
    o. Make requesting-user-uri and corresponding job/subscription description attributes REQUIRED (Printer MUST and Client MAY)
    p. Section 5.4.1: Add length 45 to definition
    q. All -uuid attributes: Explain the length is exactly 45 octets per 4122
    r. Section 5.5.1: Needs to be CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED on 5100.5
    s. Section 5.6.28:
        - Line 1064: "MUST return a URI corresponding to ..."
        - SHOULD be Printer-resident
    t. printer-icons, printer-icc-profiles, printer-supply-info-uri: SHOULD be Printer-resident
    u. Add rationale for recommending printer-resident URIs in section 3 and then provide back references in printer-icc-profiles, printer-icons, printer-strings-uri, and printer-supply-info-uri
    v. Section 6.6:
        - If the document object is supported, the document-dc-metadata MUST be document description, otherwise job description
        - Job Description attribute CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED when document object NOT supported
    w. Stopped at section 6.7
5. PWG Raster
    a. ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippraster10-20111202-rev.pdf
    b. Did not get to this

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP conference call January 9, 2012 at 1:00pm (ET)
- Ira to post updated LDAP Schema RFC
- Review new specs
- Use case discussions
- Action: Mike to adopt CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED in JPS3, PWG Raster, and IPP Everywhere 1.0
- Action: Mike to add job-error-action Job Template attribute to JPS3
- Action: Mike to fix operations table in IPP registry
- Action: Mike to add Validate-Document operation to JPS3 based on Validate-Job (no document content but optional URI)
- Action: Mike to make HTTP If-Modified-Since header support REQUIRED in IPP Everywhere
- Action: Mike to update ABNF references to [STD68] in all drafts

- Action: Ira and Mike to review 5100.x specs to remove action items, fix boilerplate copyright text in early specs, fix header/footer/document titles as needed, and fix normative references to drafts, etc. (ONGOING)
- Action: Mike to update document template to include RECOMMENDED and CONDITIONALLY REQUIRED, make level 4 headings bold (DONE)
- Action: Mike to send Ira the new XML and a diff (ONGOING - this week)
- Action: Mike to add printer-charge-info to table in IPP Everywhere 1.0, add conformance requirements for LDAP, note LDAP/SLP limitations on string lengths (127 or 255 octets) (ONGOING)
- Action: Mike to add note for DNS-SD TXT record limits (ONGOING)
- Action: Mike to add printer-device-id discussion to require required key/value pairs first to avoid issues with truncation by directory services (ONGOING)
- Action: Ira to check matching rule OIDs on lines 1766-1772 of the LDAP schema RFC (ONGOING)
- Action: Ira to send number-up-supported fix to IANA (PENDING)
- Action: Ira and Mike to work with IANA to update registry to include a "set allowed" column for attributes (ONGOING)
- Action: Ira and Glen to send additions from JDF and JTAPI to Mike (ONGOING - Glen sent a bunch, Ira will send as part of mapping work)
- Action: Mike and Paul to reach out to label/portable printer vendors to join IPP WG discussions (ONGOING - both to send summary to ipp list and details to SC list)